

Krzysztof Wach Cracow University of Economics Faculty of Economics and International Relations Department of Entrepreneurship and Innovation

Europeanisation of Entrepreneurship Education in Europe – Looking Back and Looking Forward

SUMMARY

Entrepreneurship Education is perceived as one of the key challenges of modern education systems and socio-economic growth and development. Its origins date back to the 1940s in the United States, while in Europe, depending on the individual countries to the 1980s or 1990s. In the policy of the European Union, entrepreneurial education has a significant place from the beginning of the twenty-first century and its rapid reorganization took place in 2006. The main objective of the paper is to review and discuss the efforts of the European Union itself as well as its member states in promoting entrepreneurship education in Europe. The literature and documentation review as well as its constructive critics was applied as the main research method.

 $\rightarrow \textbf{KEYWORDS} - \textbf{entrepreneurship, entrepreneurship education,} \\ \textbf{EUROPEANISATION}$

STRESZCZENIE

Europeizacja edukacji na rzecz przedsiębiorczości – dotychczasowy stan oraz przyszłe kierunki zmian

Edukacja dla przedsiębiorczości postrzegana jest jako jedno z zasadniczych wyzwań współczesnych systemów edukacyjnych oraz rozwoju społeczno-gospodarczego. Jej początki sięgają lat 40. XX wieku w Stanach Zjednoczonych, natomiast w Europie w zależności od poszczególnych krajów lat 80. lub 90. XX wieku. W polityce Unii Europejskiej przedsiębiorcza edukacja zajmuje znaczące miejsce od początku XXI wieku, a jej gwałtowne przeorganizowanie nastąpiło w 2006 roku. Głównym celem tego artykułu jest przegląd i omówienie działań Unii Europejskiej oraz jej państw członkowskich w zakresie krzewienia edukacji na rzecz przedsiębiorczości w Europie. Krytyka piśmiennictwa i przegląd dokumentacji legislacyjnej została zastosowana jako główna metoda badawcza.

→ SŁOWA KLUCZOWE – PRZEDSIĘBIORCZOŚĆ, EDUKACJA DLA PRZEDSIĘBIORCZOŚCI, EUROPEIZACJA

Introduction

Education plays a key role in shaping entrepreneurial attitudes, entrepreneurial skills and entrepreneurial culture, hence the activities of the European Union in recent years have aimed at promoting entrepreneurship as a separate subject taught at all levels of education, from elementary to tertiary (including undergraduate, graduate and PhD studies).¹ Entrepreneurial education dates back to the 1940s in the USA, while in Europe only to the 1980s. These three decades of entrepreneurship education in Europe reveal some peculiarities and differences between the USA and the EU. It can be easily seen that entrepreneurship education is influenced by the process of Europeanisation and the convergence in this field among EU member states can be observed.² Entrepreneurship is a key competence for lifelong learning, as defined in the 2006 European Framework for Key Competences. Since entrepreneurship is one of the main competences, entrepreneurship education should be considered a must.³

The main objective of the paper is the review and the discussion of the efforts of the European Union itself as well as its member states in promoting entrepreneurship education in Europe. The literature and documentation review as well as its constructive critics was applied as the main research method of this paper.

¹ Cf. Entrepreneurship Education in Europe: Fostering Entrepreneurial Mindsets through Education and Learning. Final Proceedings, Oslo 26-27 October 2006.

² Cf. K. Wach, The Scale of Internationalisation and Europeanisation of SMEs and their Operating in the Spatial Systems of the EU, "Przedsiębiorczość – Edukacja" 2014, vol. 10.

³ Cf. M.H. Morris, J.W. Webb, J. Fu, S. Singhal, A Competency-Based Perspective on Entrepreneurship Education: Conceptual and Empirical Insights, "Journal of Small Business Management" 2014, vol. 51, no. 3, pp. 352-369; S. Kurek, T. Rachwał, The Role of Business Education in the Development of Entrepreneurship in the Member States of the European Union, "Europa XXI" 2010, 19, pp. 127-142; T. Rachwał, Entrepreneurship Education as a Growth Stimulus for Family Firms (Chapter 9), in: Exploring the Dynamics of Entrepreneurship, eds. A. Surdej, K. Wach, Toruń 2010, pp. 139-156.

Enterprise and Entrepreneurship Education

The literature contains many related, and even seemingly synonymous terms, while entrepreneurship education is with the most dominant and the broadest concept. However phrases such as 'education for entrepreneurship' or 'enterprise education' also have their merit or justification. Individual authors or particular institutions differently categorize entrepreneurship education, making a different delimitation between interdependent, and even interference areas of education. Even a very brief review of the literature reveals at least two different sources defining entrepreneurship education. Some definitions take a wider context of entrepreneurship theory and focus especially on entrepreneurial capabilities, entrepreneurial skills and entrepreneurial attitudes, while other definitions focus mostly on start-ups bringing entrepreneurship education only to specific knowledge and mostly technical skills to start and run your own business. C.A. Pardo⁴ tries to answer the guestion whether business creation is the mean or the end of entrepreneurship education, nevertheless the answer is not easy. Based on the survey of entrepreneurship educators it is clear that different objectives are met – business creation or inspiration.⁵

U. Hytti and C. O'Gorman⁶ state that enterprise education aims at providing a better understanding of entrepreneurship, creating skills and giving information to start a small business and helping people to be more enterprising in their lives. Similarly, F. Liñán proposes a very wide definition of entrepreneurial education combing four dimensions of teaching effects, namely knowledge, capacities, attitudes and personal qualities:⁷

the whole set of education and training activities – within the educational system or not – that try to develop in the participants the intention to perform entrepreneurial behaviours, or some of the

⁷ Cf. F. Liñán, Intention-based Models of Entrepreneurship Education, "Piccola Impresa"/ "Small Business" 2004, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 17.

⁴ Cf. C.A. Pardo, *Is Business Creation the Mean or the End of Entrepreneurship Education? A Multiple Case Study Exploring Teaching Goals in Entrepreneurship Education*, "Journal of Technology Management & Innovation" 2013.

⁵ Cf. ibidem.

⁶ Cf. U. Hytti, C.O'Gorman, *What is 'Enterprise Education'? An Analysis of the Objectives and Methods of Enterprise Education Programmes in four European Countries*, "Education + Training" 2004, vol. 46, no. 1, pp. 11-23.

elements that affect that intention, such as entrepreneurial knowledge, desirability of the entrepreneurial activity, or its feasibility.

The British Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education QAA introduces an interesting distinction between (a) entrepreneurship education and (b) enterprise education.⁸ Enterprise education is defined as the process of providing students and /or graduates in a rich ability to generate ideas, and shaping the skills necessary to implement these ideas. In other words, enterprise education aims at disseminating and propagating entrepreneurial ventures. In turn, entrepreneurship education is designed to prepare students in terms of knowledge, skills and attitudes required in the context of creating a new project or training and running your own business. What is more, the holistic teachingand-learning process of enterprise and entrepreneurship education (EEE) should be implemented and promoted as a holistic approach combining these two interlinked fields.

Entrepreneurship education should aim at promoting entrepreneurial attitudes such as creativity, innovation, ingenuity, or taking initiative in the workplace and in one's own business. J. Guzmán and F. Liñán distinguish four categories or stages of entrepreneurship education, namely:⁹

- entrepreneurial awareness education (aiming at promoting your own business as an alternative career path),
- education for start-up (aiming at preparation for running conventional small business),
- continuing education for existing entrepreneurs (aiming at mature entrepreneurs),
- education for entrepreneurial dynamism (aiming at developing dynamic entrepreneurial behaviours after the business is already in operation).

In this respect, Europe lags behind the United States, where the elements of entrepreneurship education have been widely introduced into training programs at the level of secondary education, and most universities offer compulsory or elective courses in entrepreneurship. It should also be noted that in Europe there

⁸ Cf. Enterprise and Entrepreneurship Education. Guidance for UK Higher Education Providers, Draft for Consultations, February 2012, mimeo, pp. 2 and 7.

⁹ Cf. J. Guzmán, F. Liñán, *Perspectives on Entrepreneurial Education: A US--Europe Comparison,* Madrid 2005, pp. 6-7.

are few departments of entrepreneurship, specifically there are four times fewer than in the United States.¹⁰ In the USA the tradition of entrepreneurship education is almost a half of the century old, while in the European Union it is only three decades old (figure 1). The boom of entrepreneurship education in the USA was noted in 1980s, however the creation of new firms has been the centre of this education, so it is just a part of business education or wider economics education. In Europe the situation is a bit different, the boom of entrepreneurship education was noted in 1990s, however "the main concerns in Europe have been to establish a more entrepreneurial society and to develop more innovative and risk-taking personalities."¹¹





Source: J. Guzmán, F. Liñán, Perspectives on Entrepreneurial Education: A US-Europe Comparison, op. cit., p. 23.

¹⁰ A detailed review of academic departments of entrepreneurship in the United States can be found in the publication: J.A. Katz, *Survey of Endowed Positions in Entrepreneurship and Related Fields in the United States*, Kansas City 2003. A detailed review of such departments in Europe is discussed in the publication: *European Entrepreneurship Chairs*, Hilversum 2001.

¹¹ J. Guzmán, F. Liñán, *Perspectives on Entrepreneurial Education: A US--Europe Comparison*, op. cit., p. 24.

From the economics and business perspective I. Jamieson¹² introduces a 3-element framework for entrepreneurship education by making a distinction between (a) education about enterprises, (b) education for enterprises and (c) education in the enterprise. Education about enterprises transmits theoretical knowledge about starting and running your own business. Education for enterprises shapes the skills needed for entrepreneurs in running their own businesses, mainly managerial skills. Education in the enterprise refers to already existing businesses and helps them to develop further business skills needed to business growth.¹³ It is worth noticing that the aforementioned definition and categorization of entrepreneurship education is treated primarily as economics education or business education, which makes this approach unique and different from other perspectives.

Many authors¹⁴ suggest a clear separation between entrepreneurship education and economics education (economic education) or business education,¹⁵ although it is not an easy task,¹⁶ nevertheless as Z. Zioło and T. Rachwał note, entrepreneurship education is necessary regardless of the major being studied and especially for non-business students.¹⁷ In the economic sciences,

¹⁵ Cf. S. Kurek, T. Rachwał, *The Role of Business Education in the Development of Entrepreneurship in the Member States of the European Union*, op. cit., pp. 127-142; S. Kurek, T. Rachwał, M. Szubert, *Business Competencies in Polish School Curricula: Opinions of Teachers and Social Partners*, in: *Fit for Business. Pre-Vocational Education in European Schools*, eds. M. Pilz, S. Berger, R. Canning, Wiesbaden 2012, pp. 61-88.

¹⁶ Cf. A. Gaweł, *The Case Study Method in Entrepreneurial and Managerial Education in a Knowledge-Based Economy*, in: *The Case Study Method in Business Education*, eds. Ph. Ammerman at al., Poznań 2012, pp. 25-38.

¹⁷ Cf. Z. Zioło, T. Rachwał, *Entrepreneurship in Geographical Research*, in: *Contemporary Issues in Polish Geography*, ed. P. Churski, Poznań 2012, pp.135-155.

¹² Cf. I. Jamieson, *Schools and Enterprise*, in: *Education for Enterprise*, eds. A.G. Watts, P. Moran, Cambridge 1984, pp. 19-27.

¹³ Cf. M. Raposo, A. do Paço, *Entrepreneurship Education: Relationship between Education and Entrepreneurial Activity*, "Psicothema" 2011, vol. 23, no. 3, p. 455.

¹⁴ Cf. Ch. Volkmann at al., Educating the Next Wave of Entrepreneurs. Unlocking Entrepreneurial Capabilities to Meet the Global Challenges of the 21st Century. A Report of the Global Education Initiative, Geneva 2009; Entrepreneurship in Higher Education, especially with Non-Business Studies, Final report of the Expert Group, European Commission – Enterprise and Industry Directorate-General, Brussels – March 2008; Entrepreneurship Everywhere: The Case for Entrepreneurship Education, Columbus, OH 2008.

especially in management studies, the entrepreneurial management model (entrepreneurial management) dominates, while in economics the paradigm of entrepreneurial economy has been settled in.¹⁸ It is difficult to separate the economics education, or business education in particular, from the entrepreneurship education. Undoubtedly, economics education is an essential part of entrepreneurship education.

Entrepreneurship education includes both¹⁹ formal education²⁰ (including primary education, secondary education, university education) and informal education (including lifelong learning,²¹ media education or incidental education as well as self-improvement). What is more formal and informal entrepreneurship education should include at least three interrelated components, namely:²²

- creative education (individual and organizational entrepreneurship),
- · business education (business entrepreneurship),
- · economic education (conditions for entrepreneurship).

The first component focuses on communication skills, creativity, intrapreneurship. The second component provides knowledge and develops skills needed to undertake business, commercial

²⁰ Cf. K. Wach, Kształtowanie postaw przedsiębiorczych w programach nauczania. Stan obecny i proponowane kierunki zmian, w: Kształtowanie postaw przedsiębiorczych a edukacja ekonomiczna, red. P. Wachowiak, M. Dąbrowski, B. Majewski, Warszawa, 2007, s. 120-127; K. Wach, Entrepreneurship Education in Poland, "ERENET Profile" vol. III, no. 3 (11), pp. 36-44.

²¹ Cf. M. Najda-Janoszka, K. Wach, Lifelong Learning in the Fields of Tourism in the European Union Taking Poland into Special Consideration, in: Entrepreneurship in Tourism and Sport Business, ed. M. Bednarczyk, Kraków 2008, pp. 45-58; R. Rybkowski, Uniwersytety jako element amerykańskiego modelu gospodarczego, in: Amerykański model rozwoju gospodarczego, eds. W. Bieńkowski, M.J. Radło, Warszawa 2006, pp. 62-68.

¹⁸ Cf. K. Wach, Europeizacja małych i średnich przedsiębiorstw: rozwój przez umiędzynarodowienie, Warszawa 2012, p. 200.

¹⁹ Cf. S. Berger et al., *Curriculum-Making in Pre-vocational Education in the Lower Secondary School: A Regional Comparative Analysis within Europe, op. cit., pp. 679-701; M. Płaziak, T. Rachwał, Entrepreneurship Courses in Spatial Management Studies in Polish Universities, op. cit., pp. 710-718; T. Rachwał, Kształtowanie postaw przedsiębiorczych w edukacji szkolnej, in: Szkoła w nauce i praktyce edukacyjnej, op. cit., pp. 424-437.*

²² Cf. K. Wach, Edukacja na rzecz przedsiębiorczości wobec współczesnych wyzwań cywilizacyjno-gospodarczych, "Przedsiębiorczość – Edukacja" 2013, vol. 9, p. 250.

and social ventures.²³ The third component, having a supportive character, provides knowledge about the environment in which the firms and other ventures operate. Its mission is to promote economic knowledge, which is necessary to survive in the contemporary hostile and hyper-turbulent environment. Thus, the purpose of entrepreneurship education is to promote creativity, innovation and self-employment, and it includes (figure 2):²⁴

Figure 2. Elements in entrepreneurship education

routy Hyphaniania



Source: elaborated from J. Heinonen, S.A. Poikkijoki, An Entrepreneurial-Directed Approach to Entrepreneurship Education: Mission Impossible?, "Journal of Management Development" 2006, vol. 25, no. 1 [quoted in]: Effects and Impact of Entrepreneurship Programmes in Higher Education, European Commission – DG Enterprise & Industry, Brussels – March 2012, p. 43.

²³ Cf. A. Gaweł, Strategic Management Games from the Perspective of a Business Trainer (chapter 4), in: The Strategic Management Virtual Game Method in Business Education, eds. A. Gaweł, M. Pietrzykowski, Warszawa 2014, pp. 77-94.

²⁴ Cf. I. Kozlinska, *Contemporary Approaches to Entrepreneurship Education*, "Journal of Business Management" 2011, no. 4, p. 207; M. Raposo, A. do Paço, *Entrepreneurship Education: Relationship between Education and Entrepreneurial Activity*, op. cit., p. 454; T.N. Garavan, B. O'Cinneide, *Entrepreneurship Education and Training Programmes: A Review and Evaluation*, "Journal of European Industrial Training" 1994, vol. 18, no. 8, p. 5.

- developing personal qualities and skills that underpin the entrepreneurial spirit and entrepreneurial behaviour (creativity, a sense of initiative, risk – taking, independence, selfconfidence, leadership, team spirit),
- raising awareness among students on self-employment and entrepreneurship in general, as well as opportunities for further career,
- working on specific projects or ventures within the business, providing specific business skills and knowledge about how to start your own business and successfully leading it.

Europeanisation of Entrepreneurship Education

Research on Europeanisation is dated back to the 1970s,²⁵ although it flourished during the last decade of the 20th century and continues today, as evidenced by bibliometric analysis performed in this field.²⁶ R. Holzhacker and M. Haverland points out three waves in the Europeanisation research.²⁷ Since the 1970s the first generation of research has been using a bottom-up or uploading approach, since the 1990s the second generation of research has been using the top-down or downloading approach, while at the turn of 20th and 21st century the circular or crossloading approach has been applied to researching Europeanisation.²⁸

²⁷ Cf. R. Holzhacker and M. Haverland, *Introduction: Cooperation and Integration among Europeanized States*, in: *European Research Reloaded: Cooperation and Integration among Europeanized States*, eds. R. Holzhacker, M. Haverland, Dordrecht 2006, pp. 1-18.

²⁵ Cf. K. Wach, *Wokół pojęcia europeizacji*, "Horyzonty Polityki" 2010, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 195-208; K. Wach, *Wymiary europeizacji i jej kontekst*, "Zeszyty Naukowe Uniwersytetu Ekonomicznego w Krakowie", no. 852 (2011), pp. 29-43; K. Wach, *Internationalisation and Globalisation as the Wider Context of Europeanisation Processes from the Macro- and Microeconomic Perspective*, "Horyzonty Polityki" 2014, vol. 5, no. 10, pp. 11-30.

²⁶ Cf. K. Featherstone, *In the Name of Europe*, in: *The Politics of Europeanization*, eds. K. Featherstone, C.M. Radaelli, Oxford 2003, pp. 5-6.

²⁸ Cf. K. Wach, Europeizacja małych i średnich przedsiębiorstw: rozwój przez umiędzynarodowienie, op. cit., p. 151; K. Wach, Europeizacja – próba systematyki i konceptualizacji podejść badawczych, op. cit., pp. 17-18; K. Dyson, K.H. Goetz, Living with Europe: Power, Constraint and Contestation, in: Germany, Europe and the Politics of Constraint, eds. K. Dyson, K.H. Goetz, Oxford University Press, Oxford 2003, pp. 15-16.

ponty Hyphonsonia

The term 'Europeanisation' refers to several phenomena that are currently on the European continent. Although J. Olsen emphasizes that Europeanisation is not a *sui generis* phenomenon, however tries to explain it through the prism of three spheres, which he calls phenomena.²⁹ It is worth attempting to identify and structure dimensions of Europeanisation. In this context, one may be tempted to distinguish 12 basic dimensions of the Europeanisation including both non-economic and economic dimensions.³⁰ This concept is in fact used to describe changes in many dimensions of life, including geographical, sociological, political, legal, institutional, or economic ones (figure 3).



Figure 3. The Context of Europeanisation of Entrepreneurship Education

Source: own study.

²⁹ Cf. J.P. Olsen, *The Many Faces of Europeanization,* "Journal of Common Market Studies" 2002, vol. 40, no. 5, p. 922.

³⁰ Two more dimensions were developed based on the original concept of 10 dimensions from K. Wach, *Europeizacja małych i średnich przedsiębiorstw: rozwój przez umiędzynarodowienie,* op. cit., pp. 166-176.

The Europeanisation process occurs also in education and research however three components coexisting with each other can be pointed out, namely the Europeanisation of education, the Europeanisation of research and the Europeanisation of language (languages). Exhibiting the concept of lifelong learning in educational systems of the EU member states can be perceived as an increasingly popular trend. A practical example of the Europeanisation dimension of education and research may be the creation the central digital library of the EU in October 2008 by the European Commission called "Europeana." It is beyond its educational and scientific role as it also acts as the promotion and protection of the common European heritage and, therefore, contributes to the earlier highlighted Europeanisation.³¹

Europeanisation of education is reflected in the implementation of the Bologna Process by European universities, but also in the creation of a common framework for primary and secondary education in some aspects (e.g. guidelines for teaching entrepreneurship), the effect of which will be convergence of different educational systems of EU member states. Although the EU recommendations for the elimination of racial and religious discrimination are extremely desirable, it can sometimes cause legitimate controversy, as even in the case of religious symbols (like for example the ban on wearing religious dress in schools or protests against crosses in public buildings).³² Creating common textbooks between at least two neighbouring countries is also popular (for example the French-German history textbook). R. Rybkowski believes that the university education in Europe is the source and the explanation of 21st century Europeanisation,³³ and what is more A. Szromnik believes that internationalisation of European universities is just the strategic answer to contemporary challenges.³⁴

³¹ Cf. K. de la Durantaye, *H is fore Harmonization: The Google Book Search Settlement and Orphan Works Legislation in the European Union,* "New York Law School Law Review" 2011, vol. 55, no. 1, pp. 157-173.

³² Cf. R.K.M. Smith, *Unveiling a Role for the EU? The 'Headscarf Controversy' in European Schools*, "Education and the Law" 2007, vol. 19, no. 2, pp. 111-130.

³³ Cf. R. Rybkowski, *Europeanization of European Universities. Between Two Currents of Changes,* "Horyzonty Polityki" 2013, vol. 4, no. 8, p. 112.

³⁴ Cf. A. Szromnik, *Uczelnia na zagranicznym rynku edukacyjnym – strategia internacjonalizacji szkoły wyższej*, "Management and Business Administration. Central Europe" 2014, vol. 22, no. 1(124), pp. 36-59.

ronty Hyphonsonia

The Europeanisation of research is reflected in the intensification of joint research projects by academic centres in different member states of the EU, which is related to the preferred and beneficial rules for funding research projects carried out by such consortia (e.g. 7th FP 2007-2013, Horizons 2020). The mobility of students and academics, that encourages students and lecturers to exchange their views in other member states is just another part of the Europeanisation processes of research and education (e.g. Erasmus+, earlier Erasmus, Erasmus Mundus, Socrates, Minerva), in particular by encouraging the recognition of diplomas and periods of study at other European universities.

The Europeanisation of language refers to both individual national languages, as well as to the EU as the whole. In the first sphere, in national languages many new words with the prefix euro- were created. The phenomenon occurred also in the EU in general; here it can be defined as the creation of Euro-jargon, which sometimes can be difficult to be understood without a basic knowledge of the European integration mechanisms. On the other hand, using English in the EU, which seems to be a contemporary lingua franca, can be observed as emerging trend. At the EU level, it is a kind of Euro-English, as the rules of spelling and punctuation are typical for continental languages, and not for the British-English nor American–English. The educational systems of the member states just cultivate this trend, which is reinforced by the various EU recommendations and strategies for many years, and it was also supported on 1 January 2007 by appointing a commissioner for multilingualism and intercultural dialogue (currently the Commissioner for Education, Culture, Multilingualism and Youth).

EU Policy for Entrepreneurship Education

The Treaty on European Union (TEU) amended by the Treaty of Lisbon distinguishes three or four groups of wider policies (TFEU, articles 3-5):

- areas of exclusive competence of the EU (e.g. trade policy, customs),
- areas of shared competence (e.g. internal market, common agricultural policy),
- areas of supporting actions (e.g. industry policy, education policy), in which the EU can issue only some recommendations,

• areas that remain the exclusive competence of the member states (as a complement to the fourth group).

Entrepreneurship education is entirely up to the particular member states and the EU plays only a supporting role by issuing its opinions and recommendations, which can be implemented, but are not compulsory.

The beginnings of the entrepreneurship education in the European Union dates back to 1986, in which the trainings of young people in the field of entrepreneurship was mentioned as one of the task in the SME Action Programme for years 1987-1989,³⁵ however the very bold beginning can be found in 2000 in the European Charter for Small Enterprises, in which the first action was just entrepreneurship education and trainings (Table 1). In 2006 the Commission Communication on "Fostering Entrepreneural Mindsets Through Education and Learning" recommends entrepreneurship education to be included at all levels of formal education. One of the recommendations is as follow:³⁶

Universities and technical institutes should integrate entrepreneurship as an important part of the curriculum, spread across different subjects, and require or encourage students to take entrepreneurship courses. Combining entrepreneurial mindsets and competence with excellence in scientific and technical studies should enable student.

Year	Policy level activity	Key feature relating to Entrepreneurship education
2000	European Charter for Small Enterprises	Committed Member States to "nurture entrepreneurial spirit and new skills from an earlier age" and called for "general knowledge about business and entrepreneurship to be taught at all levels" along with "specific business- related modules" to be an "essential ingredient" of education from secondary level onwards.

Table 1. Entrepreneurship education policy development in the EU

³⁵ Cf. M. Ström, *The European Union and the Policy in favour of Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises*, seria: "Entrepreneurship Policy for the Future", Swedish Foundation for Small Business Research, Stockholm – Örebro 2011, pp. 4-5.

³⁶ Cf. Implementing the Community Lisbon Programme: Fostering entrepreneurial mindsets through education and learning, Communication from the Commission, Brussels, 13.2.2006, COM (2006) 33 final, p. 9.

How routy Hychansania

2003	Green Paper "Entrepreneurship in Europe"	"Education and training should contribute to encouraging entrepreneurship by fostering the right mindsetand skills".
2004	Action Plan "The European Agenda for Entrepreneurship"	Strategic Policy Area 1 – "Fuelling Entrep reneurial Mindsets".
2006	Commission Communication "Fostering Entrepreneurial Mindsets Through Education and Learning"	"National authorities should establish cooperation between departments leading to developing a strategy with clear objectives".
2006	Renewed Lisbon Strategy	"Underlines the need of creating an overall entrepreneurial climateand therefore invites MS to strengthen respective measures, including through entrepreneurship education".
2006	Recommendations for Key Competences in Lifelong Learning and Youth in Action	Objective – encouraging creativity and spirit of initiative and enterprise.
2006	Oslo Agenda for Entrepreneurship Education in Europe	"The aim is to step up progress in promoting entrepreneurial mindsets in society, systematically and with effective actions".
2008	Small Business Act for Europe	Principle 1: Create an environment in which entrepreneurs and family businesses can thrive and entrepreneurship is rewarded.
2010	Europe 2020 Strategy	Creativity, innovation and entrepreneurship pay important role in education systems.
2012	Commission Communication "Rethinking Education: Investing in Skills for better Socio-Economic Outcomes"	This policy initiative emphasises that, in order to build "skills for the 21st century", efforts are needed to develop transversal skills such as entrepreneurship and highlights "the ability to think critically, take initiative, problem solve and work collaboratively".
2012	Entrepreneurship 2020 Action Plan "Reigniting the entrepreneurial spirit in Europe"	One of three main pillars in entrepreneurial education and training.

Source: extended and adopted from A. McCoshan at al., *Towards Greater Cooperation and Coherence in Entrepreneurship Education*, European Commission – DG Enterprise & Industry, Birmingham – Brussels 2012, p. 70.

Entrepreneurship education should be included in the curriculum not only in the field of economics, but especially for noneconomics and non-business students, especially in the fields of science and engineering studies in both cycles (Bachelor, Master). Teaching-and-learning entrepreneurship in Europe is mainly met among students enrolled in economics and management, and for other students the possibilities for studying entrepreneurship and innovation are very limited. The EC also expresses its concern that that entrepreneurship remains primarily an elective course and tends to be offered as a separate optional course, not included in the mandatory study programme. According to the study carried out in September 2004 by European Foundation for Entrepreneurship Research (EFER) and European Foundation for Management Development (EFMD) entrepreneurship as an optional bachelor academic course is conducted in the case of 73% of Western European study programmes and 69% of the master study programs.³⁷ As a result, for some European students it is even impossible to choose entrepreneurship as an optional academic course.³⁸ It should be emphasized that the Polish reality in the field of entrepreneurship education at university level (ISCED³⁹ 5-6) is much less optimistic, although there is no specific wider research in this area. The situation in Poland for secondary primary and education (ISCED 1-3) is much better and Poland is seen as an example of best practices (Figure 4).

³⁷ Cf. K. Wilson, *Entrepreneurship Education at European Universities and Business Schools. Results of a Joint Pilot Survey*, paper presented at OECD International Conference on "Foster Entrepreneurship: The Role of Higher Education" June 23-24, 2005.

³⁸ Cf. Best Procedure: Project On Education And Training For Entrepreneurship, Final Report of The Expert Group, European Commission – DG Enterprise & Industry, Brussels 2002, p. 23.

 $^{^{\}rm 39}$ The International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED) was developed by the UNESCO for statistics and comparisons. It includes levels from 0 to 6.

routy Wychansania

Figure 4. Implementation of entrepreneurship education into general education by the member states of the EU (ISCED 1-3 in the year 2011/12)



Source: Entrepreneurship Education at School in Europe: National Strategies, Curricula and Learning Outcomes, Education, Audiovisual and Culture Executive Agency, Brussels 2012, p. 8.

The European Commission listed the promotion of entrepreneurship education as one of the priorities for action for governments of the member states, stating that:⁴⁰

- "Curricula for schools at all levels should explicitly include entrepreneurship as an objective of education, accompanied by implementation guidelines."
- "Higher education institutions should integrate entrepreneurship across different subjects and courses, notably within scientific and technical studies."

Particular and specific priority actions have been discussed by representatives of all levels of education, public administration and non-governmental organizations from 33 European countries at an international conference held in October 2006 in Oslo under the auspices of the European Commission. The result of this conference is called the "Oslo Agenda" (The Oslo Agenda for Entrepreneurship Education in Europe), which postulates as many as 49 priority actions for entrepreneurship education, for which, depending on the competence, one or some of six distinguished levels of decision-makers (European Commission, national governments, the local authorities, schools and

⁴⁰ Implementing the Community Lisbon Programme, op. cit., pp. 11-12.

universities, intermediary institutions between educational institutions and businesses as well as entrepreneurs and employers).

In November 2012, the European Commission published the communication "Rethinking Education: Investing in Skills for better Socio-Economic Outcomes", in which entrepreneurship education is a must by highlighting "the ability to think critically, take initiative, problem solve and work collaboratively" as crucial entrepreneurial skills.⁴¹

Conclusions

It is necessary to remember that "Entrepreneurship education is more than preparation on how to run a business. It is about how to develop the entrepreneurial attitudes, skills and knowledge which, in short, should enable a student to "turn ideas into action."⁴² Based on the presented literature and EU legislation review the following conclusions can be drawn:

- Entrepreneurship is a key competence for lifelong learning, as defined in the 2006 European Framework for Key Competences.
- Entrepreneurship education is a natural response to the contemporary socio-economic challenges.
- Economics education or much narrower business education must be distinguished from entrepreneurship education.
- Entrepreneurship education must fulfil three pillars and dimensions, namely creative education, start-up education and general economics education.

So far entrepreneurship education research has been flourishing worldwide and many important scientific journals start an interesting discussion on it. As J. Vanevenhoven states a natural next step for the research in entrepreneurship education is studying the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education.⁴³

⁴¹ Cf. Rethinking Education: Investing in Skills for better Socio-Economic Outcomes, Commission Communication, COM(2012)669, Brussel – 20.11-2012.

⁴² Entrepreneurship Education: A Guide for Educators, European Commission – DG Enterprise & Industry, Brussels – June 2013, p. 6.

⁴³ Cf. J. Vanevenhoven, *Advances and Challenges in Entrepreneurship Education,* "Journal of Small Business Management" 2014, vol. 51, no. 3, p. 467.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Berger S., Canning R., Dolan M., Kurek S., Pilz M., Rachwał T., Curriculum-Making in Pre-vocational Education in the Lower Secondary School: A Regional Comparative Analysis within Europe, "Journal of Curriculum Studies" 2012, vol. 44, no. 5, pp. 679-701.
- Best Procedure: Project on Education and Training for Entrepreneurship, Final Report of The Expert Group, European Commission – DG Enterprise & Industry, Brussels 2002, p. 23.

de la Durantaye K., H is fore Harmonization: The Google Book Search Settlement and Orphan Works Legislation in the European Union, "New York Law School Law Review" 2011, vol. 55, no. 1, pp. 157-173.

- Dyson K., Goetz K.H., Living with Europe: Power, Constraint and Contestation, in: Germany, Europe and the Politics of Constraint, eds. K. Dyson, K.H. Goetz, Oxford University Press, Oxford 2003, pp. 3-36.
- Effects and Impact of Entrepreneurship Programmes in Higher Education, 2012, European Commission, DG Enterprise and Industry, Brussels.
- Enterprise and Entrepreneurship Education. Guidance for UK Higher Education Providers, Draft for Consultations, The Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (QAA), February 2012, mimeo.
- Entrepreneurship 2020 Action Plan: Reigniting the Entrepreneurial Spirit in Europe, European Commission, 2013, COM(2012) 795 final, Brussels.
- Entrepreneurship Education in Europe: Fostering Entrepreneurial Mindsets through Education and Learning. Final Proceedings, European Commission – Ministry of Education and Research of Finland, Oslo 26-27 October 2006.
- Entrepreneurship Education at School in Europe: National Strategies, Curricula and Learning Outcomes, Education, Audiovisual and Culture Executive Agency, Brussels 2012.
- Entrepreneurship Education: A Guide for Educators, European Commission – DG Enterprise & Industry, Brussels – June 2013, p. 6.
- *Entrepreneurship Everywhere: The Case for Entrepreneurship Education,* Consortium for Entrepreneurship Education, Columbus, OH 2008.
- Entrepreneurship in Higher Education, especially with Non-Business Studies, Final report of the Expert Group, European Commission – Enterprise and Industry Directorate-General, Brussels – March 2008.
- *Europe 2020: A Strategy for Smart, Sustainable and Inclusive Growth,* 2010, European Commission, COM(2010) 2020 final, Brussels.
- *European Entrepreneurship Chairs,* European Foundation for Entrepreneurship Research, Hilversum 2001.
- Featherstone K., In the Name of Europe, in: The Politics of Europeanization, eds. K. Featherstone, C.M. Radaelli, Oxford University Press, Oxford 2003, pp. 5-6.
- Garavan T.N., O'Cinneide B., *Entrepreneurship Education and Training Programmes: A Review and Evaluation*, "Journal of European Industrial Training" 1994, vol. 18, no. 8, pp. 3-12.

- Gaweł A., Strategic Management Games from the Perspective of a Business Trainer (chapter 4), in: The Strategic Management Virtual Game Method in Business Education, eds. A. Gaweł, M. Pietrzykowski, Wydawnictwo lus at Tax, Warszawa 2014, pp. 77-94.
- Gaweł A., The Case Study Method in Entrepreneurial and Managerial Education in a Knowledge-based Economy, in: The Case Study Method in Business Education, eds. Ph. Ammerman at al., Bogucki Wydawnictwo Naukowe, Poznań 2012, pp. 25-38.
- Guzmán J., Liñán F., Perspectives on Entrepreneurial Education: A US-Europe Comparison, Universidad Antionio de Nebrija, Madrid 2005.
- Heinonen J., Poikkijoki S.A., An Entrepreneurial-directed Approach to Entrepreneurship Education: Mission Impossible?, "Journal of Management Development" 2006, vol. 25, no. 1.
- Holzhacker R., Haverland M., Introduction: Cooperation and Integration among Europeanized States, in: European Research Reloaded: Cooperation and Integration among Europeanized States, eds. R. Holzhacker, M. Haverland, Spinger, Dordrecht 2006, pp. 1-18.
- Hytti U., O'Gorman C., What is 'enterprise education'? An Analysis of the Objectives and Methods of Enterprise Education Programmes in four European Countries, "Education + Training" 2004, vol. 46, no. 1, pp. 11-23.
- Implementing the Community Lisbon Programme: Fostering entrepreneurial mindsets through education and learning, Communication from the Commission, Brussels, 13.2.2006, COM(2006) 33 final.
- Jamieson I., Schools and Enterprise, in: Education for Enterprise, eds. A.G. Watts, P. Moran, Careers Research and Advisory Centre CRAC, Cambridge 1984, pp. 19-27.
- Katz J.A., Survey of Endowed Positions in Entrepreneurship and Related Fields in the United States, Kauffman Center for Entrepreneurial Leadership, Kansas City 2003.
- Kozlinska I., 2011, Contemporary Approaches to Entrepreneurship Education, "Journal of Business Management", no. 4, pp. 205-220.
- Kurek S., Rachwał T., Szubert M., Business Competencies in Polish School Curricula: Opinions of Teachers and Social Partners, in: Fit for Business. Pre-Vocational Education in European Schools, eds.
 M. Pilz, S. Berger, R. Canning, Wiesbaden: VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, Springer 2012, pp. 61-88.
- Kurek S., Rachwał T., *The Role of Business Education in the Development of Entrepreneurship in the Member States of the European Union*, "Europa XXI" 2010, vol. 19, PAN, Warszawa, pp. 127-142.
- Liñán F., Intention-based Models of Entrepreneurship Education, "Piccola Impresa"/ "Small Business" 2004, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 11-35.
- McCoshan A. at al., *Towards Greater Cooperation and Coherence in Entrepreneurship Education*, European Commission – DG Enterprise & Industry, Birmingham – Brussels 2012.
- Morris M.H., Webb J.W., Fu J., Singhal S., A Competency-Based Perspective on Entrepreneurship Education: Conceptual and Empirical Insights, "Journal of Small Business Management" 2014, vol. 51, no. 3, pp. 352-369.

with Hyphansania

Najda-Janoszka M., Wach K., Lifelong Learning in the Fields of Tourism in the European Union taking Poland into Special Consideration, in: Entrepreneurship in Tourism and Sport Business, ed. M. Bednarczyk, Fundacja dla Uniwersytetu Jagiellońskiego, Kraków 2008, pp. 45-58.

- Olsen J.P., *The Many Faces of Europeanization,* "Journal of Common Market Studies" 2002, vol. 40, no. 5.
- Pardo C.A., Is Business Creation the Mean or the End of Entrepreneurship Education? A Multiple Case Study Exploring Teaching Goals in Entrepreneurship Education, "Journal of Technology Management & Innovation" 2013.
- Płaziak M., Rachwał T., Entrepreneurship Courses in Spatial Management Studies in Polish Universities, "Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences" 2014, vol. 110, pp. 710-718.
- Rachwał T., Entrepreneurship Education as a Growth Stimulus for Family Firms (Chapter 9), in: Exploring the Dynamics of Entrepreneurship, eds. A. Surdej, K. Wach, Wydawnictwo Adam Marszałek, Toruń, 2010, pp. 139-156.
- Rachwał T., *Kształtowanie postaw przedsiębiorczych w edukacji szkolnej*, in: *Szkoła w nauce i praktyce edukacyjnej*, ed. B. Muchacka, t. II, Oficyna Wydawnicza "Impuls", Kraków 2006, pp. 427-434.
- Raposo M., Paço A. do, Entrepreneurship Education: Relationship between Education and Entrepreneurial Activity, "Psicothema" 2011, vol. 23, no. 3, pp. 453-457.
- Rethinking Education: Investing in Skills for better Socio-Economic Outcomes, Commission Communication, COM(2012)669, Brussels – 20.11.2012.
- Rybkowski R., *Europeanization of European Universities. Between Two Currents of Changes,* "Horyzonty Polityki" 2013, vol. 4, no. 8, pp. 110-123.
- Rybkowski R., Uniwersytety jako element amerykańskiego modelu gospodarczego, in: Amerykański model rozwoju gospodarczego, eds.
 W. Bieńkowski, M.J. Radło, Wydawnictwo Szkoły Głównej Handlowej, Warszawa 2006, pp. 62-68.
- Smith R.K.M., Unveiling a Role for the EU? The 'Headscarf Controversy' in European Schools, "Education and the Law" 2007, vol. 19, no. 2, s. 111-130.
- Ström M., The European Union and the Policy in favour of Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises, "Entrepreneurship Policy for the Future", Swedish Foundation for Small Business Research, Stockholm – Örebro, 2011.
- Szromnik A., *Uczelnia na zagranicznym rynku edukacyjnym strategia internacjonalizacji szkoły wyższej*, "Management and Business Administration. Central Europe" 2014, vol. 22, no. 1(124), pp. 36-59.
- Treaty on European Union (TEU), OJ C 2010, no. 83, pp. 13-46.
- Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU), OJ C 2008, no. 115, pp. 47-199.
- Vanevenhoven J., *Advances and Challenges in Entrepreneurship Education,* "Journal of Small Business Management" 2014, vol. 51, no. 3, pp. 466-470.

- Volkmann Ch. at al., *Educating the Next Wave of Entrepreneurs. Unlocking Entrepreneurial Capabilities to meet the Global Challenges of the 21st Century. A Report of the Global Education Initiative*, World Economic Forum, Geneva 2009.
- Wach K., Edukacja na rzecz przedsiębiorczości wobec współczesnych wyzwań cywilizacyjno-gospodarczych, "Przedsiębiorczość – Edukacja" 2013, vol. 9, pp. 246-257.
- Wach K., *Entrepreneurship Education in Poland*, "ERENET Profile" 2008, vol. III, no. 3 (11), pp. 36-44.
- Wach K., Europeizacja małych i średnich przedsiębiorstw: rozwój przez umiędzynarodowienie, Wydawnictwo Naukowe PWN, Warszawa 2012.
- Wach K., Europeizacja próba systematyki i konceptualizacji podejść badawczych, "Horyzonty Polityki" 2013, vol. 4, no. 8, pp. 15-50.
- Wach K., Internationalisation and Globalisation as the Wider Context of Europeanisation Processes from the Macro- and Microeconomic Perspective, "Horyzonty Polityki" 2014, vol. 5, no. 10, pp. 11-30.
- Wach K., Kształtowanie postaw przedsiębiorczych w programach nauczania. Stan obecny i proponowane kierunki zmian, w: Kształtowanie postaw przedsiębiorczych a edukacja ekonomiczna, red.
 P. Wachowiak, M. Dąbrowski, B. Majewski, Fundacja Promocji i Akredytacji Kierunków Ekonomicznych, Warszawa 2007, pp. 120-127.
- Wach K., Szkoły wyższe w służbie dla rozwoju przedsiębiorczości lokalnej, "Prace Naukowe Akademii Ekonomicznej we Wrocławiu", no. 95(2002).
- Wach K., The Scale of Internationalisation and Europeanisation of SMEs and their Operating in the Spatial Systems of the EU, "Przedsiębiorczość – Edukacja" 2014, vol. 10.
- Wach K., *Wokół pojęcia europeizacji,* "Horyzonty Polityki" 2010, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 195-208.
- Wach K., *Wymiary europeizacji i jej kontekst*, "Zeszyty Naukowe Uniwersytetu Ekonomicznego w Krakowie", no. 852(2011), pp. 29-43.
- Wilson K., Entrepreneurship Education at European Universities and Business Schools. Results of a Joint Pilot Survey, paper presented at OECD International Conference on "Foster Entrepreneurship: The Role of Higher Education" June 23-24, 2005.
- Zioło Z., Rachwał T., *Entrepreneurship in Geographical Research*, in: *Contemporary Issues in Polish Geography*, ed. P. Churski, Bogucki Wydawnictwo Naukowe, Poznań 2012, pp. 135-155.